

The financial performance of Ternate city's government: Analysis before and during the pandemic covid-19

Sehat Abdullah^{1*}, Irfan Zam-Zam², Suwito³

¹ Department of Management, Khairun University, Ternate, Indonesia

^{2,3} Department of Accounting, Khairun University, Ternate, Indonesia

*Corresponding email: sehat.abdullah72@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 25 January 2022

Accepted 13 July 2022

Available 10 October 2022

ABSTRACT

Regional autonomy authorizes local governments to manage regional revenues and expenditures towards financial independence. However, during covid 19 local revenues decreased and local spending to handle covid-19 cases increased. In conventional ratio, this condition indicated as inefficient financial management. This study aims to analyze the Financial Performance of the Ternate City Government in the period before and during the Covid-19 pandemic. The method used in this research is a comparative descriptive method with a quantitative approach. The results of the study show that 1) The level of regional financial independence ratio does not change the level of regional financial independence before and during the Covid-19 Pandemic; 2) The level of PAD effectiveness ratio does not change the effectiveness ratio of Ternate City's original income for the period before and during the Pandemic. Covid-19; 3) The level of regional expenditure efficiency ratio there is no change in the level of regional financial efficiency of Ternate City before and during the Covid-19 Pandemic; 4) The level of regional financial growth ratio there is a decrease in regional financial growth during the covid-19 pandemic; 5) There is no change in the level of compatibility of spending in the Ternate City area before and during the Covid-19 Pandemic.

Keywords:

Regional autonomy, financial management, covid 19, budget management, regional resources

© 2022 The Author(s). Published by International Ecsis Association. This is an open access article under the Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.



<https://doi.org/10.55980/ebasr.v1i3.36>

1. Introduction

Regional autonomy gives freedom to local governments to manage finances, develop and explore potential local resources contained in the area (Bordignon et al., 2020; Lin & Zhou, 2022; Resce, 2022). The management of local resource is given without interference from the central government (Ji et al., 2022; Xin & Qian, 2022). This policy is in accordance with Law Number 1 of

2022 concerning the financial relations of the central government and Regional Governments and a substitute for Law Number 28 of 2009 in concerning Regional Taxes and Regional Levies.

In order to optimize the implementation of regional autonomy and to encourage its independence (Balcells & Kuo, 2021; Batterbury et al., 2020; Hu & Qian, 2017; Laut et al., 2021; Liu et al., 2022; Parker, 2022), regions are required to be more effective, creative, and innovative in formulating local government policies (Lara-Rubio et al., 2022; Zhuo et al., 2022). In this regard, the central government simplified regional fiscal regulations in an Omnibus law in regional taxation, so that Law Number 01/2022 concerning Financial Relations between the Central Government and Regional Governments was born. Based on this idea, the regional revenue management task force must be able to optimize its participation in increasing Regional Original Income (PAD) for the continuity of financing for government administration and development so as to increase regional independence and improve regional financial performance (Götze & Hartmann, 2021; Paranata, 2022; Wang & Su, 2022). Measurement of regional financial performance aims to assess the accountability and effectiveness of budget management in connection with public service activities (Paranata, 2022).

The Local Government Financial Report (Laporan Keuangan Pemerintah Daerah, LKPD) is a medium for local governments to account for their financial performance to the public. (LKPD) is examined and assessed annually in the form of an Opinion from the Financial Supervisory Agency (BPK). If the BPK provides an Unqualified Opinion (WTP), then it can be said that the financial statements of a local government entity are presented and disclosed in a fair and quality manner. Analysis report of regional financial performance is important information. This information is useful especially in making regional financial management policies and in assessing the success of local governments in managing their finances. In addition, information of regional financial performance report is important to assess the accountability of local governments better in providing services to the public. Local government accountability (Grossman et al., 2018; Sofyani et al., 2020; Van Genugten et al., 2020) can be measured through the level of effectiveness of financial management (Kyriacou, 2022).

At the beginning of 2020, Almost every country experienced a case of virus pandemic COVID-19 (Ben Hassen, 2022; Islm et al., 2021; Messabia et al., 2022; Suwito & Siskawati, 2022; Zubairu Surajo, 2022). As a result of this Pandemic, the economic activity was weakening while changing the economic system in all countries. In addition, the impacts faced in each country varies from country to country. In response to the Covid-19 pandemic, the issue of regional financial management and regional budgets must be carried out more carefully. The Regional Budget or Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBD) is the main policy instrument for local governments. As a policy instrument, APBD occupies a central position in efforts to develop the capability and effectiveness of the local government of Ternate City. APBD is used as a tool to determine the amount of income and expenditure, assist in decision-making and development planning, authorization of future expenditures, a source of development of standard measures for performance evaluation and a coordination tool for all activities of various work units of the Regional Apparatus. The purpose of this paper is to determine the financial performance of the Ternate Government, especially the period before and during the Covid-19 pandemic.

2. Methods

This research was conducted at the Ternate City Local Government. The data collection process was carried out from April to September 2022. The population and samples used in this study were the Ternate Regional Financial and Asset Management Agency in the 2018 - 2021 time period, especially before and during the COVID-19 pandemic. This is a descriptive paper with comparative studies, descriptive research aims to provide an overview, exposure and disclosure of a state, object or event. The data of this study is secondary data, namely the audited financial report of the Ternate City Regional Government, listed in the 2019 until 2021, obtained from the BPK RI North Maluku Representative. The method used in this study is a comparative descriptive method with a quantitative approach. In the descriptive method, researchers can compare certain phenomena so that it is a comparative study. The analysis of the financial performance of the Ternate City government was basically carried out to assess the financial performance of the district / City government in the past by conducting various analyses so that a financial position is obtained that represents the reality of the entity and the potential for performance on an ongoing basis.

3. Results

a. Independence Ratio

The Ternate Government obtained an average annual regional income of 9.71% (it reaches financial independence), with an upward trend from year to year. During the COVID-19 pandemic, there was a decrease from 10.80% in 2019, to 8.28%. Then it increased again in 2021 to 9.07%. The decline of income during the Covid-19 pandemic was due to restrictions on community activities during the pandemic, which had an impact on decreasing the achievement of local income.

The contribution of the original income of the Ternate City from the local tax sector is greater than that of other sectors. This is because the potential of natural resources in Ternate City is relatively small compared to other regions in the North Maluku Province, so that the Ternate City Government more encourages productivity of the trade and service sector. The trade and service sector during the pandemic is quite reliable considering the geographical position of the Ternate City which is strategic to access all regions in North Maluku Province. Amid uncertainty during covid, the transportation sector remains the solution to systemic problems faced by changing market structures (Rusakova & Saychenko, 2022).

b. Effectiveness Ratio

The effectiveness value of the Regional Original Income (PAD) of the Ternate City Government before the pandemic increased from 62.93% to 97.77%, then during the pandemic it fell to 94.82%. It implies that the management of Ternate City PAD is "Ineffective", since the Ternate regional income does not meet the Regional income Target both before and during the pandemic. During pandemic, decreasing PAD is due to the policy of refocusing activities and budget reallocation during the Covid-19 pandemic (Dreger, 2022), in addition decreasing of regional revenue is the result of PAD targeted is budgeted too high from the real potential of PAD (Lepetit & Fuentes-Albero, 2022). It should be necessary to calculate the real potential of PAD based on the real regional resource. In the financial statements, local taxes are the most significant element of PAD that contributing to regional revenue targets. The Regional Levy element contributes less because the Revenue targeted is far from its real potential revenue. In the structure of the Ternate City Budget (APBD), PAD is designed to be able to offset the large amount of expenditure even though it is far from the real potential that it should be.

c. Regional Spending Efficiency Ratio

The value of regional spending efficiency in the Ternate City before the pandemic Covid-19 decreased from 97.78% to 90.20% while during the COVID-19 pandemic it rose to 90.30%. This shows that the Ternate Government has carried out expenditure management efficiently, both before and during the pandemic. This implies that the Government of Ternate can refocusing the budget from the normative activity program to the Covid-19 handling program and spend it efficiently. This can be seen from the average efficiency ratio below 100% where the smaller this ratio, the more efficient it is, and vice versa (Lamba et al., 2022).

However, the efficiency value cannot be clearly described in the form of a outputs and outcomes ratio in programs or activities that uses regional budgets. Thus, the government has not been able to apply the expenditure Standards Analysis which requires equalization of activities. There is still a program of activities that have been completed, but the outcome has not been maximized so there needs to be a clear size of spending based on activities.

d. Regional Financial Growth Ratio

The value of Ternate City Regional Financial Growth, before the pandemic, increased from -4.60% to 8.53%. However, regional financial growth during the pandemic dropped to -3.37%. This shows that the Government of Ternate has not been able to maintain and increase regional financial growth during the Covid-19 pandemic. During the economic recovery period (in 2021) regional financial growth began to increase by 0.71%. Based on the financial statements of the Ternate government, the average increase in regional financial growth every year is 0.32% per year.

e. Regional Expenditure Compatibility Ratio Analysis

The value of Ternate City Regional Expenditure Harmony before the pandemic experienced an upward trend from 26.35% up to 27.18%, when the pandemic also increased to 30.02%. The value of Ternate City Regional expenditure Harmonization before the pandemic experienced an upward trend from 26.35% up to 27.18%, while during the pandemic also increased to 30.02%. In other words, the average value of expenditure harmonization is on the "mismatched" criterion.

This implies that the Government of Ternate is more prioritizes apparatus spending than others in allocating regional spending. This is influenced by the number of employees in the Ternate City Government very much when compared to employees in other regencies/cities in North Maluku Province. This requires a large budget allocation for employee spending.

4. Discussion

a. Level of Regional Financial Independence

The level of the Ternate City Regional Self-Reliance Ratio during 2018 to 2021 is at the "very low" criterion. There is no change in the level of regional financial independence in the period before and during the Covid-19 Pandemic. There has been a decline in the original income of the Ternate City Government during the covid-19 pandemic. The reduction in income occurs in elements of local taxes and local levies.

In 2019, the original regional income of the Ternate City was IDR 105,903,491,250.12, then in 2020 the original regional income fell to IDR 78,274,781,177.55 which means a decrease of IDR 27,628,710,072.57. This is due to the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic where the government applied physical distancing and limits community activities as an efforts to prevent the spread of the COVID-19 virus. This affects the business income, especially in the fields of tourism, creative economy, and directly affects the original income receipts of the Ternate City.

The analysis of the level of financial independence of the government aims to describe the pattern of relations between the central government and the Ternate City Government so that it can describe the level of independence of the Ternate City Government before and during the Covid-19 pandemic. The relationship pattern of the Ternate City Government on average experiences an Instructive relationship pattern, both before and during the COVID-19 pandemic. It indicates that the role of the central government is more dominant than the independence of local government, so it can be said that the regions are unable to implement regional autonomy financially.

b. Level of Effectiveness of Regional Income

The level of the Ternate City Regional Income Effectiveness Ratio during 2018 to 2021 is on the "Ineffective" criteria. It means that there is no change in the Effectiveness Ratio of The Original Revenue of the Ternate City Area for the period before and during the Covid-19 Pandemic. The achievement of the realization of Regional Income has never exceeded the target of income that has been set. The realization of PAD in the period before the covid-19 pandemic (in 2019) was Rp. 105,903,491,250.12 but during the pandemic (in 2020) it dropped to Rp.78,274,781,177.55. The regional income target in 2019 was IDR 108,316,480,000.00 then decreased during the pandemic (in 2020) of IDR 82,548,422,000.00, but then in 2021 the Ternate City government set a regional income (PAD) target of IDR 123,097,508,130.58. This number is very far from the number of realization gained in previous years. It is meaning that the government in setting the targets during the economic recovery period is too excessive without considering the aspect of the real potential of Regional Income.

The Ternate government is over optimistic in setting the target for regional income targets in the period of economic recovery, while the resources of regional income are very limited, both objects and subjects of taxes, the levy that does not increase during pandemic, and the diminishing results in managing other sources of income. The contribution of Ternate Regional Income is mostly come from the Services and Trade sector. It is due to the fact that Ternate as a transit hub for access to other regions in regencies or cities in North Maluku Province. However, during the economic recovery, the government still restricts people activities so that mobilization include visitation activities of tourism, work or business are very low. It impacts on hotel and restaurant occupancy rates, and ultimately affects gross regional domestic product declines in Ternate City Original Income. This is in line with previous studies on the analysis of the financial performance of the provincial regional income before and after the Covid-19 pandemic.

Local government set regional income target irrationally. The target is only as a counterweight the spending to cover the budget deficit, so that to achieve the predetermined targets is very difficult. The regional targets should be set based on real calculations of regional potential income which is based on the regional resource and using scientific methods and academic studies, so that PAD acceptance can be optimized.

There is no difference in the effectiveness of PAD before and after the Covid-19 pandemic due to the adjustment of the decreasing in PAD revenue targets, and due to the government policy in limiting community activities during the pandemic, theoretically, PAD revenues are more influenced

by the number of objects and subjects of regional taxes and regional levies, gross domestic product (PDRB) and economic growth of the region as well as the accuracy in forecasting the original income by comparing time series data.

c. Regional Expenditure Efficiency Level

The level of efficiency ratio of regional expenditure in Ternate City during 2018 to 2021 is on the "Efficient" criteria, this means that there is no change in the level of Financial Efficiency of the Ternate City Region in the period before and during the Covid-19 Pandemic, the achievement of expenditure realization is always less than the budget, the realization of expenditure in the period before the covid-19 pandemic (in 2019) amounted to Rp. 973,708,221,990.88 but during the pandemic (in 2020) it dropped to Rp. 943,351,349,388.26 this was due to the policy of refocusing activities and budget reallocation during the Covid-19 pandemic.

Expenditure will reach its efficiency if an activity that has been carried out with the right output, produces maximum impact by utilizing inputs or using the minimum budget. This does not mean that budget absorption or expenditure realization is smaller than the targeted expenditure, while some local government programs are not implemented. However, what is meant here is the achievement of all programs that have been set in the regional budget or APBD using a budget that is lower than the one set in the APBD, so that there is still more budget calculation left.

However, to test the efficiency of spending with targeted output and maximum impact, it is necessary to conduct an audit of each government program performance. With a performance audit, BPK auditors will look more at the performance achievement aspects of the program, and not only by looking at the comparison between the inputs and outputs of a program but also examining the outcomes and impacts of achieving goals of a program.

d. Regional Financial Growth Rate

The Regional Financial Growth Ratio of Ternate City in 2018 experienced negative growth, where in 2017 the total realization of regional income and expenditure amounted to Rp. 1,887,677,566,514.75 then fell in 2018 by Rp. 1,800,842,456,317.66 but in 2019 before the Covid-19 pandemic it rose from Rp. 1,954,434,060,052.00. However, during the Covid-19 pandemic (in 2020) it dropped to Rp. 1,888,665,110,033.78 or negative 3.37%. However, during the economic recovery (in 2021) regional financial growth began to rise to Rp. 1,902,067,027,523.32.

The local financial growth rate is a measure of the size of the local government's ability to maintain and increase its success in obtaining revenues and expenses that has been achieved from previous years, the results of the research show that there is a decline in regional financial growth during the Covid-19 pandemic. The decline in regional financial growth was due to a decrease in regional revenues, both local original income and income sourced from DBH, as well as transfer funds (DAU and DAK), in addition, policy factors for refocusing activities and reallocating budgets during the Covid-19 pandemic, especially in capital expenditure posts, most of allocated budget is for handling the Covid-19 pandemic (Cantarutti & Márquez Reiter, 2022; Georgarakos & Kenny, 2022), so that local governments cannot realize spending according to the initial target. Therefore, capital expenditure needs special attention in the next fiscal year so that negative growth does not occur.

e. Regional Expenses Harmony Level

The level of expenses harmony indicates the ability of the Ternate City government prioritizes the allocation of its funds to public service spending optimally, so that its utilization can be felt directly by the entire community. In this study, public spending programs are used because public spending is directly intended to improve people's welfare.

The level of harmony of Ternate City Regional Expense during 2018 to 2021 is on the criteria of "mismatching". This means that there is no change in the level of Ternate City Regional expense Harmony in the period before and during the Covid-19 Pandemic. This is due to the high realization of regional expense as a whole such as regional apparatus spending which is insignificant and much greater than public service spending. The Ternate Government has not been able to prioritize the portion of the public service expenditure budget because the number of employees within the Ternate City Government is very large, exceeding the needs of employees that should be. Not to mention that there are still non-permanent employees (PTT) with a large number in each SKPD.

5. Conclusion

This study discusses the analysis of the performance of the Ternate City government, so it can be concluded that: The level of financial independence of the Ternate City area during the Covid-19 pandemic has decreased, this is more due to restrictions on community activities and business actors during the pandemic, which has an impact on decreasing the achievement of Regional income. On average, Ternate City - Government relationship experience Instructive relationship patterns, both before and during the covid-19 pandemic. The level of effectiveness of the original income of the Ternate City during the COVID-19 pandemic has decreased. It shows that the management of Ternate City PAD has an "Ineffective" criterion due to the policy of refocusing activities and budget reallocation during the Covid-19 pandemic, in addition to determining pad targets that are budgeted too high from the real potential of PAD which is true.

The level of financial efficiency of the Ternate City during the Covid-19 pandemic has increased, this shows that the Ternate City Government has carried out efficient expenditure management both before and during the pandemic. The regional financial growth rate of Ternate City during the Covid-19 pandemic has decreased, this shows that the Ternate City government has not been able to maintain and increase regional financial growth during the Covid-19 pandemic, but during the economic recovery (in 2021) regional financial growth began to rise.

During the pandemic, this also increases and it implies that the Ternate City Government in allocating regional expenditures is more dominantly prioritized on apparatus spending, this is influenced by the number of employees working in the Ternate Government when compared to employees in other regencies in North Maluku Province so that it requires a large enough budget allocation for employee expenditures as well, especially it is coupled with the policy of providing TPP for ASNs. Regional Revenue plays a very important role, therefore Regional Native Revenue is expected to need to be optimized so that it becomes the largest part of all regional revenues in carrying out local government administration, because an important factor in regional financial capabilities can be seen from the amount of Regional Original Income, so that the level of fiscal dependence by the Ternate City Government on the central government can be reduced.

6. References

- Balcells, L., & Kuo, A. (2021). Preferences in between: Moderates in the catalan secessionist conflict. *Politics and Governance*, 9(4), 386–398. <https://doi.org/10.17645/pag.v9i4.4563>
- Batterbury, S. P. J., Kowasch, M., & Bouard, S. (2020). The geopolitical ecology of New Caledonia: Territorial re-ordering, mining, and Indigenous economic development. *Journal of Political Ecology*, 27(1), 594–611. <https://doi.org/10.2458/V27I1.23812>
- Ben Hassen, T. (2022). A Transformative State in the Wake of COVID-19: What Is Needed to Enable Innovation, Entrepreneurship, and Education in Qatar? *Sustainability*, 14(13), 7953. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14137953>
- Bordignon, M., Gamalerio, M., & Turati, G. (2020). Manager or professional politician? Local fiscal autonomy and the skills of elected officials. *Regional Science and Urban Economics*, 83(May 2019). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.regsciurbeco.2020.103529>
- Cantarutti, M. N., & Márquez Reiter, R. (2022). “What have you done?” Accounting for Covid-19 lockdown breaches on talk radio. *Discourse, Context and Media*, 49(December 2021). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dcm.2022.100639>
- Dreger, C. (2022). Economic impact of the Corona pandemic: Costs and the recovery after the crisis. *Asia and the Global Economy*, 2(1), 100030. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aglobe.2022.100030>
- Georgarakos, D., & Kenny, G. (2022). Household spending and fiscal support during the COVID-19 pandemic: Insights from a new consumer survey. *Journal of Monetary Economics*, 129, S1–S14. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmoneco.2022.02.007>
- Götze, V., & Hartmann, T. (2021). Why municipalities grow: The influence of fiscal incentives on municipal land policies in Germany and the Netherlands. *Land Use Policy*, 109. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2021.105681>
- Grossman, G., Platas, M. R., & Rodden, J. (2018). Crowdsourcing accountability: ICT for service delivery. *World Development*, 112, 74–87. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2018.07.001>
- Hu, F. Z. Y., & Qian, J. (2017). Land-based finance, fiscal autonomy and land supply for affordable housing in urban China: A prefecture-level analysis. *Land Use Policy*, 69(October),

- 454–460. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2017.09.050>
- Islm, T., Meng, H., Pitafi, A. H., Ullah Zafar, A., Sheikh, Z., Shujaat Mubarik, M., & Liang, X. (2021). Why DO citizens engage in government social media accounts during COVID-19 pandemic? A comparative study. *Telematics and Informatics*, 62(July 2020), 101619. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tele.2021.101619>
- Ji, H., No, W., & Yeo, J. (2022). Community factors and local governments' hazard mitigation efforts: Focusing on nonprofit organizations. *International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction*, 83(April), 103394. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijdr.2022.103394>
- Kyriacou, A. P. (2022). Clientelism and fiscal redistribution: Evidence across countries. *European Journal of Political Economy*, xxx, 102234. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejpoleco.2022.102234>
- Lamba, S., Wolfson, C., Cardona, C., Alfonso, Y. N., Gemmill, A., Resnick, B., Leider, J. P., McCullough, J. Mac, & Bishai, D. (2022). Past local government health spending was not correlated with COVID-19 control in US counties. *SSM - Population Health*, 17(January), 101027. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmph.2022.101027>
- Lara-Rubio, J., Navarro-Galera, A., Buendía-Carrillo, D., & Gómez-Miranda, M. E. (2022). Analysing financial risks of local governments to design sustainability policies for public services: An empirical study by the population size. *Cities*, 128(June). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2022.103795>
- Laut, L. T., Sugiharti, R. R., & Panjawa, J. L. (2021). Does tourism sector matter in regional economic development. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 37(3), 832–837. <https://doi.org/10.30892/GTG.37313-715>
- Lepetit, A., & Fuentes-Albero, C. (2022). The limited power of monetary policy in a pandemic. *European Economic Review*, 147(April), 104168. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.euroecorev.2022.104168>
- Lin, B., & Zhou, Y. (2022). Understanding the institutional logic of urban environmental pollution in China: Evidence from fiscal autonomy. *Process Safety and Environmental Protection*, 164(April), 57–66. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psep.2022.06.005>
- Liu, F., Feng, J., Zhai, G., & Razzaq, A. (2022). Influence of fiscal decentralization and renewable energy investment on ecological sustainability in EU: What is the moderating role of institutional governance? *Renewable Energy*, 200(September), 1265–1274. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.renene.2022.10.036>
- Messabia, N., Fomi, P. R., & Kooli, C. (2022). Managing restaurants during the COVID-19 crisis: Innovating to survive and prosper. *Journal of Innovation and Knowledge*, 7(4), 100234. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jik.2022.100234>
- Paranata, A. (2022). The miracle of anti-corruption efforts and regional fiscal independence in plugging budget leakage: evidence from western and eastern Indonesia. *Heliyon*, 8(10), e11153. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e11153>
- Parker, J. (2022). Europe's Secessionist Movements and Covid-19. *Nationalities Papers*, 50(1), 118–129. <https://doi.org/10.1017/nps.2020.103>
- Resce, G. (2022). The impact of political and non-political officials on the financial management of local governments. *Journal of Policy Modeling*, 44(5), 943–962. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpolmod.2022.08.004>
- Rusakova, T., & Saychenko, O. (2022). Virtual labor market during the COVID-19 pandemic and their impact on transport industry. *Transportation Research Procedia*, 63, 2021–2029. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trpro.2022.06.225>
- Sofyani, H., Riyadh, H. A., & Fahlevi, H. (2020). Improving service quality, accountability and transparency of local government: The intervening role of information technology governance. *Cogent Business and Management*, 7(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2020.1735690>
- Suwito, S., & Siskawati, E. (2022). Sharia business resilience during the covid-19 pandemic : A case study of Indonesian sharia banking business. *Economics, Business, Accounting & Society Review*, 1(2), Press. <https://doi.org/10.55980/ebasr.v1i2.22>
- Van Genugten, M., Van Thiel, S., & Voorn, B. (2020). Local governments and their arm's length bodies. *Local Government Studies*, 46(1), 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03003930.2019.1667774>
- Wang, Q. S., & Su, C. W. (2022). Fiscal decentralisation in China: Is the guarantee of improving energy efficiency? *Energy Strategy Reviews*, 43(February), 100938. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.esr.2022.100938>
- Xin, F., & Qian, Y. (2022). Does fiscal decentralization promote green utilization of land

resources? Evidence from Chinese local governments. *Resources Policy*, 79(August), 103086.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resourpol.2022.103086>

Zhuo, H., Yu, C., & Zhang, W. (2022). Response or avoidance: The reaction of local governments to the central government's housing market control policies. *Cities*, 129(June), 103895.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2022.103895>

Zubairu Surajo, A. (2022). Covid-19 pandemic and social exclusion in Kano Metropolis: challenges and the prospects. *Economics, Business, Accounting & Society Review*, 1(2), Press.
<https://doi.org/10.55980/ebasr.v1i2.21>